

## iCAHE JC Critical Appraisal Summary

### Journal Club Details

---

<b>Journal Club</b>	Community Social Work
<b>JC Facilitator</b>	Malcolm Tyler & Christine Batten
<b>JC Discipline</b>	Social Work

### Clinical Scenario

What is the effectiveness of arts-based group work interventions in the treatment of chronic depression/anxiety, in comparison with individual interventions such as CBT or counseling?

### Review Question/PICO/PECO

- P adults with chronic depression or anxiety
- I arts-based group work intervention
- C individual interventions such as CBT or counseling
- O level of depression or anxiety

### Article/Paper

Slayton S, D'Archer J & Kalan F (2010) Outcome Studies on the Efficacy of Art Therapy: A Review of Findings, *Art Therapy: Journal of the American Art Therapy Association*, 27(3) pp. 108-118.

*Please note: due to copyright regulations CAHE is unable to supply a copy of the critically appraised paper/article. If you are an employee of the South Australian government you can obtain a copy of articles from the [DOHSA librarian](#).*

**Article Methodology:** Systematic Review

**Journal club meeting on:** 23 March 2011



CONTACTS

www.unisa.edu.au/cahe  
 karen.grimmer-somers  
 @unisa.edu.au  
 Telephone (08) 8302 2769  
 Facsimile (08) 8302 2766

University of South Australia  
 GPO Box 2471  
 Adelaide SA 5001  
 Australia

CRICOS Provider Number  
 001218



iCAHE

University of South Australia | International Centre for Allied Health Evidence

A member of the Sansom Institute

Ques No.	Yes	Can't Tell	No	Comments
1			✓	<p><b>Did the review ask a clearly-focused question?</b></p> <p>The review examined studies from 1999-2007 (last review on this topic was conducted in 2000) that measured outcomes of art therapy effectiveness in all population.</p> <p><i>Population:</i> People of all ages; of clinical and non-clinical populations  <i>Intervention:</i> Art Therapy  <i>Outcome:</i> Any measure that reflects change in the status of participants</p>
2	✓			<p><b>Did the review include the right type of study?</b></p> <p>Yes, after analysis the reviewers have sorted the studies into four main groups of art therapy outcome studies: (a) thorough and detailed qualitative studies, (b) single-subject pre/post test designs, (c) designs using control and treatment groups without random assignment, and (d) controlled clinical trials with randomized assignment to groups. Qualitative and quantitative studies were used with the article including a description of these different styles. These outcome studies were appropriate to address the study question and it is seen that although most of the studies do not meet the highest standard in efficacy research, they do serve to add support to the few that do.</p> <p><b>Is it worth continuing? YES</b></p>
3	✓			<p><b>Did the reviewers try to identify all relevant studies?</b></p> <p>A wide range of electronic databases was searched, including PsycINFO, Medline/PubMed, CINAHL, ERIC, EMBASE, Genamia JournalSeek, and Sagepub using specific keywords: <i>art therapy, treatment outcomes, measurement, psychological assessment, and outcomes.</i></p> <p>To identify how far the field has come since previous studies there was also a systematic review of the academic journals in the field of art therapy including <i>Art Therapy: Journal of the American Art Therapy Association, The Arts in Psychotherapy, The Canadian Journal of Art Therapy and The International Journal of Art Therapy.</i></p>
4			✓	<p><b>Did the reviewers assess the quality of the included studies?</b></p> <p>The authors did not examine the quality of included studies.</p>

5			<p><b>If the results of the studies have been combined, was it reasonable to do so?</b></p> <p>The results section provided a table which describes the characteristics of each included study. The population, intervention (nature of art therapy being examined) and outcomes examined by the different studies, including the study designs were varied (i.e. heterogeneous); results of the studies are merely reported.</p>
6		N/A	<p><b>How are the results presented and what is the main result?</b></p> <p>The results are presented throughout the article in text and mainly tables.</p> <p><i>Bottom line result:</i> Even though much more research is needed, the review found that a small body of evidence to support the use of art therapy now exists. Art therapy can be effective in treating a variety of symptoms in different age groups and conditions.</p>
7		✓	<p><b>How precise are these results?</b></p> <p>Precision of results could not be determined based on the analysis done in this systematic review.</p>
8	Journal Club to answer		<p><b>Can the results be applied to the local population?</b></p> <p><b>Were all important outcomes considered?</b></p> <p><b>Should policy or practice change as a result of the evidence contained in this review?</b></p>

**CONTACTS**

www.unisa.edu.au/cahe  
 karen.grimmer-somers  
 @unisa.edu.au  
 Telephone (08) 8302 2769  
 Facsimile (08) 8302 2766

University of South Australia  
 GPO Box 2471  
 Adelaide SA 5001  
 Australia

CRICOS Provider Number  
 001218



University of  
 South Australia



International Centre for  
 Allied Health Evidence

A member of the Sansom Institute