



## iCAHE JC Critical Appraisal Summary

### Journal Club Details

---

<b>Journal Club location</b>	Northern Adelaide Local Health Network
<b>JC Facilitator</b>	Kate Hodges
<b>JC Discipline</b>	Speech Pathology

### Background

We would like to investigate as a team; evidence for differential diagnosis between Children with Language Disorder versus Autism Spectrum Disorder

### Review Question/PICO/PACO

- P: Preschool children with impaired language and social skills
- I: Differential Diagnosis of Language Disorders vs Autism Spectrum Disorder
- C: Diagnostic tools
- O: Evidence for accurate differential diagnosis.

### Article/Paper

Gibson, J.; Adams, C.; Lockton, E. & Green, J. (2013). Social communication disorder outside autism? A diagnostic classification approach to delineating pragmatic language impairment, high functioning autism and specific language impairment. *Journal of Child Psychology and Psychiatry* 54:11, pp 1186–1197

*Please note: due to copyright regulations CAHE is unable to supply a copy of the critically appraised paper/article. If you are an employee of the South Australian government you can obtain a copy of articles from the [DOHSA librarian](#).*

Click [here](#) to access critical appraisal tool

Ques No.	Yes	Can't Tell	No	Comments
1	✓			<p><b>Was there a clear question for the study to address?</b></p> <p>The study aimed to further elucidate the behavioural and linguistic profile associated with impairments of social communication occurring outside of an autism diagnosis.</p>
2				<p><b>Was there a comparison with an appropriate reference standard?</b></p> <p>NA</p> <p><b>Is it worth continuing?</b> Yes</p>
3	✓			<p><b>Did all patients get the diagnostic test and reference standard?</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Manchester inventory for playground observation</li> <li>• Repetitive behaviour questionnaire Version 2</li> <li>• Clinical evaluation of language fundamentals UK version 4</li> </ul>
4				<p><b>Could the results of the test have been influenced by the results of the reference standard?</b></p> <p>NA</p>
5	✓			<p><b>Is the disease status of the tested population clearly described?</b></p> <p>Six to eleven year olds diagnosed with pragmatic language impairment (PLI), high functioning autism (HFA) or specific language impairment (SLI)</p>
6	✓			<p><b>Were the methods for performing the test described in detail?</b></p> <p>Limited detail was provided, but the tests are standard tests.</p>
7				<p><b>What are the results?</b></p> <p>Greater degrees of difficulties with social interaction with peers, restricted and repetitive behaviours/interests and expressive language ability discriminated high functioning autism from pragmatic language impairment.</p> <p>Pragmatic language impairment was differentiated from specific language impairment by elevated difficulties with social interaction with peers and higher expressive language ability, but indistinguishable from specific language impairment using restricted and repetitive behaviours/interests.</p> <p>A significant effect of group on social interaction with peers subscales was observed, and pragmatic language impairment and high functioning autism groups shared a similar social interaction with peers subscale profile.</p>

**CONTACTS**

www.unisa.edu.au/cahe  
iCAHE@unisa.edu.au  
Telephone: +61 8 830 22099  
Fax: +61 8 830 22853

University of South Australia  
GPO Box 2471  
Adelaide SA 5001  
Australia

CRICOS Provider Number  
00121B



University of  
South Australia

International Centre for  
Allied Health Evidence

iCAHE

8			How sure are we about the results? (consequences and cost of alternatives performed?) NA
9	Discuss in your Journal Club		Can the results be applied to your patients/ the population of interest?
10			Can the test be applied to your patient or population of interest?
11			Were all outcomes important to the individual or population considered?
12			What would be the impact of using this test on your patients/population?
13			What do the study findings mean to practice (i.e. clinical practice, systems or processes)?
14			What are your next steps? (e.g. evaluate clinical practice against evidence-based recommendations; organise the next four journal club meetings around this topic to build the evidence base; organize training for staff, etc.)
15			What is required to implement these next steps?

**CONTACTS**

www.unisa.edu.au/cahe  
iCAHE@unisa.edu.au  
Telephone: +61 8 830 22099  
Fax: +61 8 830 22853

University of South Australia  
GPO Box 2471  
Adelaide SA 5001  
Australia

CRICOS Provider Number  
00121B



University of  
South Australia

International Centre for  
Allied Health Evidence  
iCAHE

A member of the Sansom Institute