

iCAHE JC Critical Appraisal Summary

Journal Club Details

Journal Club location	Flinders Medical Centre
JC Facilitator	Pamela Hewavasam
JC Discipline	Speech Pathology
CAT completed by:	Matt Ransom

Question

Is there an association between dysphagia and mortality in nursing home residents?

Review Question/PICO/PACO

P: Nursing home residents aged 65 years or older

I: Dysphagia

O: 6-month mortality

Article/Paper

Wirth, R., Pourhassan, M., Streicher, M., Hiesmayr, M., Schindler, K., Sieber, C.C. and Volkert, D., 2018. The Impact of Dysphagia on Mortality of Nursing Home Residents: Results From the nutritionDay Project. Journal of the American Medical Directors Association.

Please note: due to copyright regulations CAHE is unable to supply a copy of the critically appraised paper/article. If you are an employee of the South Australian government you can obtain a copy of articles from the [DOHSA librarian](#).

Article Methodology: Cross sectional study



University of
South Australia

International Centre for
Allied Health Evidence

iCAHE

A member of the Sansom Institute

Ques No.	Yes	Can't Tell	No	Comments
1	√			<p>Did the study address a clearly focused issue?</p> <p>The aim of this study is to evaluate the association of dysphagia and mortality in nursing home residents and identify further risk factors for mortality in residents with dysphagia.</p>
2	√			<p>Did the authors use an appropriate method to answer their question?</p> <p>Annual, voluntary 1-day cross-sectional survey Yes, however, could have been better</p> <p>Is it worth continuing? Yes</p>
3	√ Just			<p>Was the cohort recruited in an acceptable way?</p> <p>Annual, voluntary 1-day cross-sectional survey Could have been done better</p>
4	√			<p>Was the exposure accurately measured to minimize bias?</p> <p>Used the nutritionDAY nursing home questionnaires which were accessible in multiple languages. See paper for more details on questionnaire.</p>
5		√		<p>Was the outcome accurately measured to minimize bias?</p> <p>Mortality after 6 months – unsure how this was collected? Study mentions that it excluded all missing outcome data. Was mortality reported by nursing home? Or follow up with participants?</p>

CONTACTS

www.unisa.edu.au/cahe
iCAHE@unisa.edu.au
Telephone: +61 8 830 22099
Fax: +61 8 830 22853

University of South Australia
GPO Box 2471
Adelaide SA 5001
Australia

CRICOS Provider Number
00121B



University of
South Australia

International Centre for
Allied Health Evidence
iCAHE

A member of the Sansom Institute

CONTACTS
 www.unisa.edu.au/cahe
 iCAHE@unisa.edu.au
 Telephone: +61 8 830 22099
 Fax: +61 8 830 22853

University of South Australia
 GPO Box 2471
 Adelaide SA 5001
 Australia

CRICOS Provider Number
 00121B



University of
 South Australia

International Centre for
 Allied Health Evidence
 iCAHE

A member of the Sansom Institute

6	√ Only some		<p>Have the authors identified all important confounding factors?</p> <p>Lots of factors come into mortality. Authors could have provided more information on cohort.</p> <p>Table 1 Baseline Characteristics of Participants With and Without Dysphagia</p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Characteristic</th> <th>No Dysphagia</th> <th>Dysphagia</th> <th>P Value</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td></td> <td>8617 (84.6)</td> <td>1568 (15.4)</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>Female</td> <td>6752 (78.7)</td> <td>1206 (77.4)</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>Male</td> <td>1839 (21.3)</td> <td>355 (22.6)</td> <td>.238</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Age, y, mean ± SD</td> <td>85.2 (8.0)</td> <td>85.0 (8.3)</td> <td>.221</td> </tr> <tr> <td>BMI, mean ± SD</td> <td>25.3 (5.5)</td> <td>22.4 (5.0)</td> <td><.001</td> </tr> <tr> <td>BMI <20</td> <td>1275 (14.8)</td> <td>531 (33.9)</td> <td><.001</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Weight loss >5 kg*</td> <td>830 (9.6)</td> <td>321 (20.5)</td> <td><.001</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Oral nutritional supplements</td> <td>877 (10.2)</td> <td>370 (23.6)</td> <td><.001</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Tube feeding</td> <td>29 (0.3)</td> <td>229 (14.6)</td> <td><.001</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Severe cognitive impairment</td> <td>2132 (24.7)</td> <td>1005 (64.1)</td> <td><.001</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Immobility</td> <td>1897 (22.0)</td> <td>1111 (70.9)</td> <td><.001</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Mortality</td> <td>1024 (11.9)</td> <td>388 (24.7)</td> <td><.001</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <p>SD, standard deviation. Values are n (%) unless otherwise indicated. *Weight loss during previous year.</p> <p>Have they taken account of the confounding factors in the design and/or analysis?</p> <p>Regression analysis conducted</p> <p>Table 2 Regression Analysis of 6-Month Mortality and Its Risk Factors: Adjustment for Potential Confounders</p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th rowspan="2"></th> <th colspan="2">Model 1 (R² = 0.586)</th> <th colspan="2">Model 2 (R² = 0.592)</th> <th colspan="2">Model 3 (R² = 0.600)</th> <th colspan="2">Model 4 (R² = 0.601)</th> </tr> <tr> <th>OR (95% CI)</th> <th>P Value</th> <th>OR (95% CI)</th> <th>P Value</th> <th>OR (95% CI)</th> <th>P Value</th> <th>OR (95% CI)</th> <th>P Value</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Dysphagia</td> <td>2.78 (2.00-2.60)</td> <td><.001</td> <td>1.62 (1.39-1.88)</td> <td><.001</td> <td>1.44 (1.24-1.68)</td> <td><.001</td> <td>1.46 (1.25-1.71)</td> <td><.001</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Age[‡]</td> <td>0.98 (0.98-0.98)</td> <td><.001</td> <td>0.98 (0.97-0.98)</td> <td><.001</td> <td>0.97 (0.97-0.97)</td> <td><.001</td> <td>0.97 (0.97-0.97)</td> <td><.001</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Gender (female)[§]</td> <td>0.79 (0.69-0.90)</td> <td><.001</td> <td>1.00 (0.88-1.15)</td> <td>.969</td> <td>1.03 (0.90-1.18)</td> <td>.699</td> <td>1.03 (0.91-1.19)</td> <td>.603</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Cognitive impairment[¶]</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>1.21 (1.06-1.37)</td> <td>.04</td> <td>1.15 (1.01-1.30)</td> <td>.037</td> <td>1.14 (1.00-1.29)</td> <td>.052</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Immobility</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>1.76 (1.15-2.00)</td> <td><.001</td> <td>1.66 (1.45-1.89)</td> <td><.001</td> <td>1.65 (1.45-1.88)</td> <td><.001</td> </tr> <tr> <td>BMI <20</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>1.78 (1.55-2.03)</td> <td><.001</td> <td>1.68 (1.48-1.95)</td> <td><.001</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Weight loss >5 kg</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>1.61 (1.37-1.88)</td> <td><.001</td> <td>1.58 (1.35-1.85)</td> <td><.001</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Tube feeding</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>0.88 (0.60-1.16)</td> <td>.291</td> </tr> <tr> <td>ONS</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>1.25 (1.06-1.47)</td> <td>.008</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <p>R², Nagelkerke pseudo-R-squared. ‡Continuous variable. §Female vs male. ¶Severe cognitive impairment vs no severe impairment. Immobility vs no immobility.</p>	Characteristic	No Dysphagia	Dysphagia	P Value		8617 (84.6)	1568 (15.4)		Female	6752 (78.7)	1206 (77.4)		Male	1839 (21.3)	355 (22.6)	.238	Age, y, mean ± SD	85.2 (8.0)	85.0 (8.3)	.221	BMI, mean ± SD	25.3 (5.5)	22.4 (5.0)	<.001	BMI <20	1275 (14.8)	531 (33.9)	<.001	Weight loss >5 kg*	830 (9.6)	321 (20.5)	<.001	Oral nutritional supplements	877 (10.2)	370 (23.6)	<.001	Tube feeding	29 (0.3)	229 (14.6)	<.001	Severe cognitive impairment	2132 (24.7)	1005 (64.1)	<.001	Immobility	1897 (22.0)	1111 (70.9)	<.001	Mortality	1024 (11.9)	388 (24.7)	<.001		Model 1 (R ² = 0.586)		Model 2 (R ² = 0.592)		Model 3 (R ² = 0.600)		Model 4 (R ² = 0.601)		OR (95% CI)	P Value	OR (95% CI)	P Value	OR (95% CI)	P Value	OR (95% CI)	P Value	Dysphagia	2.78 (2.00-2.60)	<.001	1.62 (1.39-1.88)	<.001	1.44 (1.24-1.68)	<.001	1.46 (1.25-1.71)	<.001	Age [‡]	0.98 (0.98-0.98)	<.001	0.98 (0.97-0.98)	<.001	0.97 (0.97-0.97)	<.001	0.97 (0.97-0.97)	<.001	Gender (female) [§]	0.79 (0.69-0.90)	<.001	1.00 (0.88-1.15)	.969	1.03 (0.90-1.18)	.699	1.03 (0.91-1.19)	.603	Cognitive impairment [¶]			1.21 (1.06-1.37)	.04	1.15 (1.01-1.30)	.037	1.14 (1.00-1.29)	.052	Immobility			1.76 (1.15-2.00)	<.001	1.66 (1.45-1.89)	<.001	1.65 (1.45-1.88)	<.001	BMI <20					1.78 (1.55-2.03)	<.001	1.68 (1.48-1.95)	<.001	Weight loss >5 kg					1.61 (1.37-1.88)	<.001	1.58 (1.35-1.85)	<.001	Tube feeding							0.88 (0.60-1.16)	.291	ONS							1.25 (1.06-1.47)	.008
Characteristic	No Dysphagia	Dysphagia	P Value																																																																																																																																																						
	8617 (84.6)	1568 (15.4)																																																																																																																																																							
Female	6752 (78.7)	1206 (77.4)																																																																																																																																																							
Male	1839 (21.3)	355 (22.6)	.238																																																																																																																																																						
Age, y, mean ± SD	85.2 (8.0)	85.0 (8.3)	.221																																																																																																																																																						
BMI, mean ± SD	25.3 (5.5)	22.4 (5.0)	<.001																																																																																																																																																						
BMI <20	1275 (14.8)	531 (33.9)	<.001																																																																																																																																																						
Weight loss >5 kg*	830 (9.6)	321 (20.5)	<.001																																																																																																																																																						
Oral nutritional supplements	877 (10.2)	370 (23.6)	<.001																																																																																																																																																						
Tube feeding	29 (0.3)	229 (14.6)	<.001																																																																																																																																																						
Severe cognitive impairment	2132 (24.7)	1005 (64.1)	<.001																																																																																																																																																						
Immobility	1897 (22.0)	1111 (70.9)	<.001																																																																																																																																																						
Mortality	1024 (11.9)	388 (24.7)	<.001																																																																																																																																																						
	Model 1 (R ² = 0.586)		Model 2 (R ² = 0.592)		Model 3 (R ² = 0.600)		Model 4 (R ² = 0.601)																																																																																																																																																		
	OR (95% CI)	P Value	OR (95% CI)	P Value	OR (95% CI)	P Value	OR (95% CI)	P Value																																																																																																																																																	
Dysphagia	2.78 (2.00-2.60)	<.001	1.62 (1.39-1.88)	<.001	1.44 (1.24-1.68)	<.001	1.46 (1.25-1.71)	<.001																																																																																																																																																	
Age [‡]	0.98 (0.98-0.98)	<.001	0.98 (0.97-0.98)	<.001	0.97 (0.97-0.97)	<.001	0.97 (0.97-0.97)	<.001																																																																																																																																																	
Gender (female) [§]	0.79 (0.69-0.90)	<.001	1.00 (0.88-1.15)	.969	1.03 (0.90-1.18)	.699	1.03 (0.91-1.19)	.603																																																																																																																																																	
Cognitive impairment [¶]			1.21 (1.06-1.37)	.04	1.15 (1.01-1.30)	.037	1.14 (1.00-1.29)	.052																																																																																																																																																	
Immobility			1.76 (1.15-2.00)	<.001	1.66 (1.45-1.89)	<.001	1.65 (1.45-1.88)	<.001																																																																																																																																																	
BMI <20					1.78 (1.55-2.03)	<.001	1.68 (1.48-1.95)	<.001																																																																																																																																																	
Weight loss >5 kg					1.61 (1.37-1.88)	<.001	1.58 (1.35-1.85)	<.001																																																																																																																																																	
Tube feeding							0.88 (0.60-1.16)	.291																																																																																																																																																	
ONS							1.25 (1.06-1.47)	.008																																																																																																																																																	
7	√		<p>Was the follow up of subjects complete enough?</p> <p>6 month follow up – adequate but could have been more</p>																																																																																																																																																						
8			<p>What are the results of this study?</p> <p>The 6-month mortality of residents with dysphagia was significantly higher than of those without dysphagia (24.7% vs 11.9%; P < .001). The multivariate regression analysis revealed dysphagia [odds ratio (OR) 1.44, 95% confidence interval (CI) 1.24-1.68, P < .001] along with body mass index <20 (OR 1.78, 95% CI 1.55-2.03, P < .001) and weight loss >5 kg (OR 1.61, 95% CI 1.37-1.88, P < .001) as independent and significant risk factors for mortality. Because of significant interaction, a disproportionately high mortality of 38.9% was found in residents with dysphagia accompanied by previous weight loss >5 kg (OR for interaction 1.44; 95% CI 1.03-2.01; P = .032).</p> <p>The authors concluded dysphagia was identified as an independent risk factor for 6-month mortality in nursing home residents. In particular, residents with dysphagia accompanied by weight loss are at a disproportionately high risk of mortality and should therefore receive special attention.</p>																																																																																																																																																						

CONTACTS

www.unisa.edu.au/cahe
 iCAHE@unisa.edu.au
 Telephone: +61 8 830 22099
 Fax: +61 8 830 22853

University of South Australia
 GPO Box 2471
 Adelaide SA 5001
 Australia

CRICOS Provider Number
 00121B



University of
 South Australia

International Centre for
 Allied Health Evidence

iCAHE

A member of the Sansom Institute

9		<p>How precise are the results?</p> <p>P values, odds ratios and 95% Confidence intervals are reported. Confidence intervals demonstrated a range of precision across conditions.</p>
10	Journal Club to discuss	<p>Do you believe the results?</p>
11		<p>Can the results be applied to the local population? Choose relevant context issues. The following are only suggestions to prompt discussion.</p> <p>CONTEXT ASSESSMENT</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Infrastructure - Available workforce (? Need for substitute workforce?) - Patient characteristics - Training and upskilling, accreditation, recognition - Ready access to information sources - Legislative, financial & systems support - Health service system, referral processes and decision-makers - Communication - Best ways of presenting information to different end-users - Availability of relevant equipment - Cultural acceptability of recommendations - Others
12		<p>Were all important outcomes considered?</p>
13		<p>Are the benefits worth the harms and costs?</p>
14		<p>What do the study findings mean to practice (i.e. clinical practice, systems or processes)?</p>
15		<p>What are your next steps?</p> <p>ADOPT, CONTEXTUALISE, ADAPT</p> <p>And then (e.g. evaluate clinical practice against evidence-based recommendations; organise the next four journal club meetings around this topic to build the evidence base; organize training for staff, etc.)</p>
16		<p>What is required to implement these next steps?</p>